

**IANA STEWARDSHIP TRANSITION COORDINATION GROUP MEETING #2**  
**6 September 2014**  
**Chat Room Transcript**

Alice Jansen: Welcome to the ICG meeting #2! The chat session is being archived and follows the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior:

<http://www.icann.org/en/news/in-focus/accountability/expected-standards>

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Good morning, I'll be attending this meeting through Adobe Connect. Could the technical team please enable my microphone? Thanks.

Video: Jean-Jacques, we will need you to call the conference bridge please.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: ... and Jean-Jacques Subrenat, appointed by the ALAC.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Sorry, my micro^hone has not been enabled!

Patrik Fältström - SSAC: Thanks J-J!

demi getschko: good morning, Jean-Jacques!

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: good morning Demi!

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Adiel, I'd like to suggest that the selection committee observe one rule: applications should be encouraged not only from the usual countries (US, UK, Australia, NZ...).

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: All: I'm waiting for Technical Staff to enable my microphone...

Alice Jansen: Apologies - the transcript will be back shortly.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Ah, glad to be able to speak!

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Staff, could you please show the relevant paragraph?

Alice Jansen: Hi Jean-Jacques, I have informed Mohamed that you have your hand up

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Chair, I've had my hand up...

Patrik Fältström: JJ noted

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Mohamed, I don't need to speak if you can answer my question: was our compromise text (suggested by Alan G) properly integrated into the current draft?

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: my hand up

Patrik Fältström: J-J, are you comfortable with the direction, or do you want to speak?

Patrik Fältström: Ok, your hand is noted

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: thanks

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: ok.

Josh Baulch: If you are having a hard time reading the top presentation, you can select the Full Screen button at the top of the pod, and make it full screen for yourself.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: thanks Josh.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: But cannot scroll.

Josh Baulch: Yeah, it is a screen share, not an actual document min adobe connect

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: understood.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: #Lynn +1.

Alice Jansen: Hi Jean-Jacques, I have just uploaded the document and given screen control so that you can scroll through it

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Thanks Alice.

Martin: I've joined the call. Hello all and sorry I'm late

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Mohamed & All: I'd not noticed this before, but under O, paragraph 2 starts with "proposals are expected to enjoy a broad consensus of support from all interested parties". Is this really necessary? Expected by whom? Are we setting a standard or expressing hopes? I suggest this sentence be deleted.

Alice Jansen: Welcome, Martin!

Lynn St.Amour: @Jean-Jacques: what about "The ICG expects proposals to

enjoy...

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Lynn, it would still be open to a question: is the ICG entitled to "expect" this or that? A RFP is a binding document, not a place to express wishes...

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Kavouss: I proposed deleting 2<sup>nd</sup> paragraph of chapter 0, but I did not delete anything. No one has commented my proposal, for the time being.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Lynn: or do you mean something like "In making proposals, communities are expected to have garnered the support of the communities they represent"?

Elise Gerich: I am able to here the discussion and am following mthe discussion.

Lynn St.Amour: @Jean-Jacques - this is hard to edit in this manner. s/communities they represent/affected stakeholders/?

Elise Gerich: "hear" not "here."

Martin: can we have the adobe connect screen on the bit that is mbeing discussed at the time

Elise Gerich: Martin, you should be able to scroll it.

Martin: Hard to know where to...

Video: IV

Video: V now

Elise Gerich: There is an echo on the audio while Jean-Jacques is speaking.

Alice Jansen: All, I have just uploaded V16 into the Adobe Connect and you should have scroll control.

Elise Gerich: Good. The echo has stopped.

Alice Jansen: you can also select the Full Screen button at the top of the pod and make it full screen for yourself.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Kavouss: +1.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Daniel +1.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Milton +1

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Milton +1, "broad consensus".

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: "required": yes.

Patrik Fältström: J-J: FYI, I just managed to get Adobe Connect up and running, and will be able to follow you better.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Patrik: good, thanks.

Martin: NZ keith +1

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: So now, could Paul read the whole paragraph?

Alice Jansen: The ICG will be back in 20 minutes at 9:20 UTC.

Alice Jansen: We are back

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Am back on the call.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Sounds all right.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Milton +1, throughout the text.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: #Kavouss +1 for "interested and/or affected, as the case may be"

Video: We will be dropping video to help conserve bandwidth in the physical meeting room, which will allow more people to log into adobe connect and interact. Thank you

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Video: understood.

Martin: Joe + 1

Martin: very important that we are open for clarification

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: my hand is up

Mohamed El BASHir: will give you the chance

Alice Jansen: Now projecting the announcement

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Daniel: yes for "should" rather than any expectation.

Alice Jansen: What you are seeing in the presentation pod is what is being projected in the room.

Elise Gerich: Will someone scroll it past Step 3?

Elise Gerich: Thank you.

Elise Gerich: Yes

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Joe: good point, communities should send without waiting for cut-off date.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Paul: yes.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: aMary: yes, alignment necessary.

Alissa Cooper: I would view testing as: test the parts that are feasible to test.

Alice Jansen: Jean-Jacques Alissa, Martin - Mohamed has added you to the queue

Martin: I will need to leave in 30 minutes. Could we do decision-making be done 15.00 or 15.30?

Mohamed El Bashir 2: I will give Martin, JJS and Alissa the next chance

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Nobody has reacted to the point I made (after Adiel and Kavouss) about "testing"...

Martin: the document on the screen is not the correct one

Mohamed El Bashir 2: i did wwrite the point, a clarification text regarding the "testing" is needed

Mohamed El Bashir 2: Rus update can include a clarification text bout "texting "

Mohamed El Bashir 2: alissa you are next

Alissa Cooper: my hand is not up

Mohamed El Bashir 2: yes, noted .. you are next in the line

Alissa Cooper: I do not want to be in the queue

Alissa Cooper: if we could see the quorum language on the screen that would help

Alissa Cooper: thx

Alice Jansen: Hi Mohamed - Martin is in the queue

Mohamed El Bashir 2: Thanks, will give next slot

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Mohamed, I'm in the queue too.

Alissa Cooper: me too, now

Mohamed El Bashir 2: Talking order : Kieth, Joe, JJS and Alissa

Mohamed El Bashir 2: Then Jari

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Staff, could you enable my scrolling, so that I can look at the text? Thanks.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Staff: thanks.

Ergys Ramaj: You should be able to scroll now

Edmon: perhaps there could be levels of consensus too?

Edmon: full consensus / strong consensus / rough consensus

Edmon: with varying minority/dissent ststemnets

Martin: I like Joe's comment period for those who could not be present. I do need to go now. I will rejoin as soon as I can, but that won't be until 15.00 Istanbul

Keith Davidson: Thanks Martin

Elise Gerich: Terrible echo all of a sudden

Elise Gerich: better now

Alice Jansen: Hi Elise, I do not see any mics turned on in the room - are you still hearing strong echo?

Elise Gerich: the echo stopped when

Elise Gerich: alissa began to speak

Alice Jansen: ok

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Alissa, democracy is sometimes "messy", and certainly more so than any other -cracy.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: (13:06) So Chair, I request that Secretariat take note of my formal request that the possibility of a vote be retained. Same for quorum.

Alissa Cooper: If we have a mechanism to reduce the mess ( the mailing list), why not use it?

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Alissa: a vote has the added advantage of making clear who took what position.

Alissa Cooper: Recommendation designation has the same property.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Jari: good question, "how was this group formed?"...

Elise Gerich: I think the speaker is Russ Mundy - not Russ Housley

Jen-Schuck: Thank you, Elise, for that clarification

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: My hand was up.

Elise Gerich: My regrets. I will be unable to rejoin in 90 minutes. Sorry that I will miss the rest of the meeting.

Alice Jansen: We are now breaking for lunch and will be back at 14:15 local time, 11:15 UTC

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Chair, I formally request that my position be recorded in the minutes, about voting and quorum. Those who have just spoken at length against, are mainly 5 or 6 people in the operational community. But the ICG is 30 people. So, here's proof that "consensus" practiced in this way is really quite limited.

Mohamed El Bashir: we have started the next session of the meeting

Mohamed El Bashir: currently discussing " ICANN Enhanced Accountability - relationship with ICG"

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: hello, just testing my remote connection.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Chair, I would be grateful if you, or this morning's Chair, would acknowledge my last message of this morning on this chat.

Alissa Cooper: Would be interesting to get a sense of the room as to who is

planning on participating heavily in the accountability track.

Patrik Fältström: J-J, this transcript is part of the result of this meeting

Patrik Fältström: We do not have any "formal minuting"

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Thanks Patrik; are we coming back to that later today?

Patrik Fältström: Yes

Patrik Fältström: I.e. what I mean is that both transcript from audio, and this chat, is part of the result of the meeting.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Chair, I'd be prepared to report on the ALAC.

Patrik Fältström: J-J, ok, but short, very short. 2 min

Patrik Fältström: Alissa, clarification q?

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: ok.

Patrik Fältström: Sorry J-J...I was unclear.

Alissa Cooper: FWIW, I hope we don't wait until ICANN51 to hear an answer to that question I asked.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: no problem.

Patrik Fältström: Order is: NRO (now), IETF, SSAC, CCNSO, ALAC

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: ok

Video: JJ please speak up a bit

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Who are the members of the Selection committee?

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Adiel, could you please answer my 2 questions: 1) in your draft, is there something about the global nature of our search? and 2) who are the members of the committee, and how were they appointed?

Patrik Fältström: 1. The group was selected by ICG a few months ago, 2. The document that is ICG portion of the package is what is available in dropbox

Patrik Fältström: I.e. "the group" has been working with ICANN already creating "the RFP package"



Patrik Fältström: The question now is whether we should have the same group or not

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Patrik: ok, so I request to be included in the committee. I'm sure that, although late, my request is not excessive. I do have a bit of experience, after all...

Patrik Fältström: Your comment was not excessive.

Patrik Fältström: Your request is noted

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: what about my request? ;-)

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: thanks.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Mohamed and Lynn: +1.

Martin: I'm back on line

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Keith D: +1.

Alissa Cooper: it would be useful to know who in the ICG us conflicted out from being involved in the subcommittee per ICANN policy and the Lynn/Mohamed criteria.

Alissa Cooper: \*is

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Daniel: I request that the idea about diversity be included. Wording, I can work on with you.

Mohamed El Bashir: operational community members

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Chair: I object if that notion is not included.

Alissa Cooper: Mohamed, who are those exactly? :)

Alissa Cooper: e.g., are the SSAC reps operational community members?

Mohamed El Bashir: my proposal for the evaluation group, as per my understanding, ccTLD, gTLDs, RIRs, protocol .. happy can be corrected

Patrik Fältström: ok JJ, you are in the queue

Keith Drazek (gTLD Registries): I don't have strong feelings about needing a separate group. I just want to make sure that, if it's still a question, that Jean Jacques isn't accidentally conflicted out. I'm totally fine with having the same

group continue on.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Adiel: diversity concerns OUTREACH, not criteria

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Adiel: so just make sure that our RFP is distributed widely.

Patrik Fältström: JJ: noted

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Kavouss: +1 (and speaking as a former ICANN Board member).

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Russ +1.

Mohamed El Bashir: good for me

Mohamed El Bashir: ICANN procurement guidelines :  
<https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/procurement-guidelines-21feb10-en.pdf>

Alissa Cooper: hand up

Patrik Fältström: Yes Alissa

Alissa Cooper: thx

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Alissa, if the document is to be shared with "a few people", in that case it should be shared with all ICG members.

Alissa Cooper: was just trying to expedite

Alissa Cooper: since I'm guessing the ICANN folks that Theresa needs to consult are not working today

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Alissa: I understand, but that would bring up a question of principle about equality among members.

Alissa Cooper: as I said, anyone who is interested -- could be everyone. we can get the email addresses together. personally I don't need to see it.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Adiel: please send it to me too.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Patrik: agreed.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Patrik & Daniel: yes for a poll.

Patrik Fältström: Alissa, hand up?

Alissa Cooper: yes

Mohamed El Bashir: hearing other colleagues, i am fine with the roatation of the selected time slots ( 4:00m 12:00, 20:00 UTC/GMT )

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Patrik: no, we should be available is requested.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: (if requested), but we do not need to reach out for such meetings.

Alissa Cooper: hand up

Patrik Fältström: Ok, Alissa!

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: @Paul: indeed.

Keith Drazek (gTLD Registries): In the interest of time, I'll type into chat insted of speaking. Perhaps instead of individual group meetings, we should consider hosting a webinar where anyone can dial in and engage with us. We could develop an update presentation and have the ability to engage in Q&A. I do think giving the community an opportunity to engage directly with us is a beneficial thing. It would be bad for us to be viewed as a faceless inaccessible group.

Mohamed El Bashir: We have 2 options proposed :

Patrik Fältström: Keith, noted.

Keith Drazek (gTLD Registries): Thanks Patrik.

Alissa Cooper: is this in Dropbox?

Keith Drazek (gTLD Registries): Yep!

Alissa Cooper: thx

Alice Jansen:

[https://www.dropbox.com/sh/7x5poce3wb8ffsv/AAAV7L3hf6YaEN3U\\_ZKg4J3ca/Timeline/TimelineDiscussion-v4.docx?dl=0](https://www.dropbox.com/sh/7x5poce3wb8ffsv/AAAV7L3hf6YaEN3U_ZKg4J3ca/Timeline/TimelineDiscussion-v4.docx?dl=0)

Patrik Fältström: I think what you say is similar to what Jari and Alissa said.

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: Staff could you let me scroll for my own use?

Keith Drazek (gTLD Registries): "Anticipated Timeline"

Alissa Cooper: this document should include the links for how to comment

Alissa Cooper: Comment submission: [icg-forum@icann.org](mailto:icg-forum@icann.org) List of comments submitted via this site: <http://forum.icann.org/lists/icg-forum>

Keith Drazek (gTLD Registries): +1 Russ H. We should post this today if possible and seek feedback. Call it an "Anticipated Timeline" and let's get it out there.

Keith Drazek (gTLD Registries): If nothing else, getting it out for public review will give NTIA something concrete to respond to. This is critical if our delivery date is somehow off. Need to know that ASAP.

Martin: Got to go, sorry

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: TAKE CARE: in current draft, date of Step 4 is after date of Step 5.

Patrik Fältström: Bye Martin

Alissa Cooper: another suggestion: put the xox

Alissa Cooper: xox graphic in this doc

Alissa Cooper: \*xls

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: am in queue

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: have question

Jean-Jacques Subrenat: hello, Chair?

Patrik Fältström: JJ noted

Alissa Cooper: we can maybe circulate specific focused questions to consider on the next call re consensus doc

Ergys Ramaj: Meeting adjourned. Thanks all!

Alice Jansen: Thank you for participating in this meeting!