

**ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY REVIEW TEAM –
11 12 13 October – Boston Meeting**

NOTES: *We encountered a technical difficulty with October 11 chat content and were unable to retrieve substance. Apologies for any inconvenience caused.
No chat content for October 13*

Louie Lee: Hi

CLO: Morning Warren

Louie Lee: Good [morning|afternoon|evening] to all joining remotely.

CLO: ref point Page 8 of the document

CLO: in the pod above

CLO: Recommendations start on p 10

warren adelman (privately): cory can you call out to me by Skype

Louie Lee: on p.11 now

Becky Burr: hard to hear Chris

Becky Burr: and Peter

Cory Schruth: Sorry Becky, they're away from their mics.

Becky Burr: at a break remind them, please, because this is an important discussion

CLO: is it better now?

Brian Cute: How is the sound online? Can you hear Chris?

Becky Burr: a little better

Louie Lee: Replacing recommendations 2-4 with: Increase the transparency of the Nominating Committee's deliberations and discision-making process by doing such things as:....

Louie Lee: ...clearly articulating the timeline and skill-set criteria at the earliest stage possible...

Louie Lee: ...before the process starts and once the process is complete -- (explain the choices made)

CLO: Alice we have loat scroll ability...

CLO: lost *sigh* in pod 1 above

CLO: No it's OK now it may have been refreshing

ICANN Presenter: apologies for the inconvenience

Alice Jansen: p 20

Kieren McCarthy: I would like to see ICANN change its default wrt getting things private. At the moment, it is secrecy as a default, with openness have to be argued for and agreed to. It should be the other way around - with openness as a defauly and secrecy having to be explained and agreed to

Louie Lee (ATRT): CLO is showing her "colored thingies" to the room. :)

Kieren McCarthy: Ah the good old days :-)

CLO: :-)

CLO: For the record they are Peters 'coloured thingies" He was kind enough to lend them to me

Kieren McCarthy: Is this an effective way of running this meeting: with Peter acting as a defendant and given disproportionate speaking team. There are nine other members, including a chair

Kieren McCarthy: speaking time (not team)

Jim Fleming: The Board is Window Dressing - They have no control of "the Staff"

Jim Fleming: "The Staff" is well-paid by Verisign and a few others

Jim Fleming: What on earth do 150 Staff do each day ? Can the Board describe what they do ?

Jim Fleming: How was the ICANN CEO selected ? Where is the audit trail ?

CLO: Board / Board sub committee and use of recognised 3rd party in the last case Egon Zendar

CLO: all that is published on ICANN web site

Jim Fleming: The "Staff" is certainly Transparent - No one can explain what the staff does. - Where is the Staff Organization Chart ? Where are the Time Records ?

Kieren McCarthy: Cheryl - did you just engage Jim? Cue reams of nonsense...

Jim Fleming: What on earth do 150 Staff do each day ?

Jim Fleming: Why are Staff compensated at 4 or 5 times the norm ?

Jim Fleming: This is Stone-Walling !!!!

Robin Gross: Is there audio here? I don't hear anything.

Cory Schruth: We are on break for another few minutes.

Robin Gross: ok - thanks.

RobH (privately): Hi Cory! Hope all is well.

Cory Schruth (privately): Hi Rob - Yes, thanks!

CLO: Starting in a moment

warren adelman: mic issue

warren adelman: hold

Becky Burr: what is GAC opinion?

Becky Burr: are the case studies public?

Guest: not yet

peter Dengate Thrush: "opinion" is used in the bylaws where it says that the Board can ask the GAC....

peter Dengate Thrush: everywhere else it says "advice"

Becky Burr: thx. does the acknowledge the potentially different requirements depending upon whether something is related to the development and formulation of policy rather than implementation?

peter Dengate Thrush: Becky; not in the bylaws....no

Becky Burr: i think there is a potential problem - who decides what may raise public policy concerns?

Becky Burr: I think the the GAC has to rely on the GAC Chair to report on the Board's activities so that the GAC can decide what raises public policy concerns

Becky Burr: otherwise the Board has to formally notify the GAC about everything

Becky Burr: because there is absolutely no definition of public policy - other than anything that a government is interested in

Becky Burr: j. The advice of the Governmental Advisory Committee on public policy matters shall be duly taken into account, both in the formulation and adoption of policies. In the event that the ICANN Board determines to take an action that is not consistent with the Governmental Advisory Committee advice, it shall so inform the Committee and state the reasons why it decided not to follow that advice. The Governmental Advisory Committee and the ICANN Board will then try, in good faith and in a timely and efficient manner, to find a mutually acceptable solution.

Becky Burr: this is very specific regarding GAC role re implementation v policy development

peter Dengate Thrush: I think inherent in this is the board's ability to decline to accept advice on grounds that it does not relate to public policy...

peter Dengate Thrush: which would lead to a requirement to carefully define what public policy is...

Becky Burr: good luck on that one

peter Dengate Thrush: ... thought I'd ask you to define that for us Becky..;-)

Robin Gross: did audio go down?

Cory Schruth (privately): Nope, I'm monitoring it and it's working fine.

Cory Schruth: I'm monitoring it and it's working fine.

Louie Lee (ATRT): hear it now?

Robin Gross: I don't hear anything

Louie Lee (ATRT): I get the audio over the adobe connect stream

Robin Gross: I will exit and re-enter. maybe that will re-start it.

Robin Gross: that did the trick - I hear it again.

Brian Cute: About to recommence

Louie Lee (ATRT): can y'all hear us (crunching on chips)?

Robin Gross: yes, back on - thanks.

Louie Lee (ATRT): great

Louie Lee (ATRT): we're on last page of WG3 draft....

Louie Lee (ATRT): and covering berkman's input related to these recommendations

Alice Jansen: Please refer to p15

CLO 2: off now till tomorrow morning 0800 EST

CLO 2: Correctipon EDT

Alice Jansen: Many thanks to all for your participation