

# PUBLIC COMMENT ON SHORT-TERM OPTIONS TO ADJUST THE TIMELINE FOR SPECIFIC REVIEWS

You may use this document to facilitate your response to the short-term options discussed in the Public Comment. Some relevant sections of the Public Comment have been copied here for ease of reference.

Please complete the ranking tables on page 4 for ATRT3. There are boxes available to provide additional comments below each of the ranking tables.

Save this document and send it to:

**comments-specific-reviews-short-term-timeline-14may18@icann.org.**

ATRT3 SHORT-TERM OPTIONS					
Review   Option	Potential Topics	Advantages	Disadvantages	Execution Needs	\$ Savings in FY19
<b>ATRT3   A “No change”</b> Begin as soon as feasible <sup>1</sup> (estimate: July 2018).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Evaluation of implementation of prior review (ATRT2) recommendations;</li> <li>○ Other topics, limited to avoid duplication /overlap with CCWG-WS2 topics.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ No further delay.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Strain on volunteer and ICANN resources (work of ATRT3 must be completed in 12 months from seating of team);</li> <li>○ Difficulties in limiting/containing scope;</li> <li>○ Potential for duplication/overlap with CCWG-WS2 topics.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Completion of Review Team appointment process by SO/AC chairs;</li> <li>○ Selection of ICANN Board member to serve on the Review Team;</li> <li>○ Coordination between CCWG-WS2 and ATRT3.</li> </ul>	None
<b>ATRT3   B “Limit Review to Implementation of Prior Recommendations”</b> Begin as soon as feasible (estimate: July 2018).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Evaluation of implementation of prior review (ATRT2) recommendations<sup>2</sup>.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ No further delay;</li> <li>○ Lesser strain on volunteer and ICANN resources than Option A.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Strain on volunteer and ICANN resources (work of ATRT3 must be completed in 12 months from seating of team);</li> <li>○ Difficulties in limiting/containing scope;</li> <li>○ Potential for duplication/overlap with CCWG-WS2 topics.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Completion of Review Team appointment process by SO/AC chairs;</li> <li>○ Agreement by ATRT3 to limit the scope;</li> <li>○ Selection of ICANN Board member to serve on the Review Team;</li> </ul>	\$250,000 <sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> To date, two organizations have not completed their nominations -- the SSAC and the ASO (see status of the selection process [<https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=74586688>] and the list of nominated applicants [<https://community.icann.org/display/atrt/Applications+Received>]). Given that the call for volunteers commenced in January 2017, ample time has been given to the community to complete its selection process.

<sup>2</sup> The only topic required for the ATRT3 is the assessment of prior ATRT recommendation implications. [Bylaws Section 4.6\(b\)\(iii\)](#).

<sup>3</sup> Based on adherence to scope limitations and assumption that expert resources will not need to be identified (pursuant to Section 4.6(a)(iv)) because of the limited scope.

ATRT3 SHORT-TERM OPTIONS					
Review   Option	Potential Topics	Advantages	Disadvantages	Execution Needs	\$ Savings in FY19
<b>ATRT3   C “Commence RT work upon Board action on CCWG-WS2 recommendations”<sup>4</sup></b> (with the work of the Review Tam to start no later than 30 June 2019 and conclude within twelve months, as prescribed in the Bylaws <sup>5</sup> ).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Evaluation of implementation of prior review recommendations;</li> <li>○ Other topics, limited to avoid duplication or overlap with CCWG-WS2 topics.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Lessened strain on volunteer and ICANN resources;</li> <li>○ Short-term deferral – date can be reasonably estimated.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Potentially critical reaction that ICANN is delaying its accountability commitments by deferring the review.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Community agreement to defer;</li> <li>○ Community to determine appropriate course of action for volunteers who applied to serve in response to the call in January 2017; potential re-initiation of call.</li> </ul>	\$320,000 <sup>6</sup> + \$30,000 in FY18

<sup>4</sup> The CCWG-Accountability Work Stream 2 recommendations are expected to be delivered to the Board in June 2018, and decisions on approval and implementation are expected to happen within a matter of months after the delivery of the final report.

<sup>5</sup> [Bylaws Section 4.6\(b\)\(v\)](#) states “The Accountability and Transparency Review Team should issue its final report within one year of convening its first meeting.”

<sup>6</sup> Based on assumption that a limited number of face to face meetings would occur in FY19.

## ATRT3 Short-Term Options

Rank the three options discussed in the Public Comment in order of preference. Choose one option (A, B, or C) for each choice (1st, 2nd, or 3rd).

	ATRT3 Option A	ATRT3 Option B	ATRT3 Option C
1st Choice			
2nd Choice			
3rd Choice			

Provide any additional comments or other input related to ATRT3 Short Term Options in the box below. If you have additional ideas or options please use this space or send a separate document to:

[comments-specific-reviews-short-term-timeline-14may18@icann.org](mailto:comments-specific-reviews-short-term-timeline-14may18@icann.org).

Thank you for participating in this Public Comment.