

Accountability and Transparency Review Team

Wednesday, May 5th 2010 - Thursday, May 6th 2010

Marina del Rey, LA

Preliminary Report

RT Selectors and Members

(PDT) Peter Dengate Thrush
(JK) Janis Karklins
(MI) Manal Ismail, Vice Chair
(LS) Lawrence Strickling
(WA) Warren Adelman
(BB) Becky Burr
(FC) Fabio Colasanti
(WC) Willie Currie
(BC) Brian Cute, Chair
(EI) Erick Iriarte
(CLO) Cheryl Langdon-Orr
(LL) Louie Lee
(OM) Olivier Muron
(XZ) Xinsheng Zhang

Assistants invited by RT Members

(FA) Fiona Alexander
(JM) James Bladel
(GF) Guo Feng

Executive Staff

(RB) Rod Beckstrom
(DB) Doug Brent
(JJ) John Jeffrey
(DM) Denise Michel

Supporting Staff

(DC) David Closson
(AJ) Alice Jansen
(JS) Jesse Samora
(CS) Cory Schruth

This was the first face-to-face meeting of the Accountability and Transparency Review Team (RT). The RT undertook the following:

- **Adoption of Conflict of Interest policy and Declarations of Interest**

The RT decided to adopt a simplified version of the ICANN Board of Directors' Conflict of Interest (Col) policy and to publicly disclose the Members' interests in a Declaration of Interest document.

- **Election of the Chair and Vice-Chair**

- The RT elects Brian Cute as Chair and Manal Ismail as Vice-Chair. Chair and Vice Chair to serve as full participants of the RT.

- **Interviews with ICANN Staff and ICANN CEO**

The RT conducted interviews with ICANN Staff members Doug Brent, COO, Denise Michel, Advisor to the CEO for Accountability and Transparency and John Jeffrey, General Counsel. The RT also conducted an interview with ICANN CEO Rod Beckstrom.

- **Adoption of the Review Methodology and Timetable**

The RT agrees to focus data collection on three periods:

- - 30 September 2009 – present - Affirmation of Commitments
- - 1 October 2006 - 30 September 2009 - Last Joint Project Agreement and Accountability and Transparency undertakings by ICANN
- - Prior to October 2006

- **Discussion of proposed Conceptual Framework**

The RT decides to adopt a working definition of “accountability” subject to modification as the RT continues its work.¹ The RT will consider different conceptual frameworks including One World Trust which was basis for ICANN Accountability and Transparency Review in 2007.

- **Discussion of possible Performance Indicators**

The RT discussed whether performance indicators could address each of the AoC paragraph 9.1 provisions. Performance indicators should be aimed at better measurement of ICANN performance in the future.

¹ The working definition of accountability is: “Accountability refers to a process by which individuals and organizations are answerable for their actions, decisions and processes on an ongoing basis and for the consequences that follow from them. The GAP framework unpacks accountability into four dimensions: transparency, participation, evaluation, and complaint and response mechanisms. These enable an organization to give an account to, take account of, and be held to account by, stakeholders; and are a reflection of an organization’s proactive or reactive approach to accountability. To be accountable, an organization needs to integrate all dimensions into its policies, procedures and practice, at all levels and stages of decision-making and implementation, in relation to key stakeholders.”

Summary of other actions taken

- The RT adopted a methodology for its meetings and work. All meetings will be open to the public. Any RT member may request that the RT meet in closed session with such sessions to be scribed but not recorded. Closed meetings can be held under "Chatham House Rules." Preliminary Reports of meetings to be posted within 24 hours. Minutes of meetings to be provided within 5 days of meetings. Recordings of meetings to be posted as soon as possible after meetings.²
- The RT agreed on the following decision-making process:
 - The RT will seek consensus on recommendations but consensus is not required to make recommendations
 - Reports and recommendations will reflect dissenting views, if any.
- The RT agrees that there is a difference between data collection tasks and verification of data resolves to have ICANN staff seconded to support data collection and to assign the verification tasks to the Chair and Vice-Chair.
- The RT agrees to submit a draft a list of questions for public comment.
- The RT agrees that Members have discretion to report back to their SOs and ACs as they deem fit.
- The RT agrees to meet with the ICANN Board, the GAC, the Board/GAC Working Group and the Community at the ICANN Brussels meeting
- The RT decides to adopt the following calendar and deliverables:
 - **May 15 2010** - Deadline to post questions to Community
 - **June 18-19 2010** - RT face-to-face meeting in Brussels
 - **June 20-25 2010** – Meet with ICANN Board, GAC, Board/GAC Working Group and ICANN Community
 - **September 14-17 2010** - IGF meeting in Vilnius – RT members who are attending IGF to explore possible rump meetings for public input

² Complete methodology document to be posted to Affirmation of Commitments Review site.
<http://www.icann.org/en/reviews/affirmation/review-1-en.htm>

- **September 2010** – RT face-to-face meeting in Asia. Location TBD
- **October 2010** – RT **face-to-face** meeting in Egypt
- **December 5-10 2010** RT **face-to-face** meeting in Cartagena, Columbia
- **31 December 2010** – Deadline to submit recommendations to the Board