

Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRT)

Friday, June 18th 2010 - Friday, June 25th 2010

Brussels, Belgium

Preliminary Report

RT Selectors and Members

(PDT) Peter Dengate Thrush
(MI) Manal Ismail, Vice Chair
(LS) Lawrence Strickling
(WA) Warren Adelman
(BB) Becky Burr
(FC) Fabio Colasanti
(WC) Willie Currie
(BC) Brian Cute, Chair
(EIA) Erick Iriarte Ahon
(CLO) Cheryl Langdon-Orr
(LL) Louie Lee
(OM) Olivier Muron
(ZX) Zhang Xincheng

Assistants invited by RT Members

(FA) Fiona Alexander
(JM) James Bladel
(FG) Feng Guo

Supporting Staff

(ON) Olof Nordling
(DM) Denise Michel
(AJ) Alice Jansen

This was the second F2F meeting of the Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRT). The RT undertook the following:

a) Adoption of a working schedule

The Review Team adopted a working schedule with deliverables as to issue its recommendations on December 31st. Please refer to the ATRT's activities webpage:

<http://www.icann.org/en/reviews/affirmation/activities-1-en.htm> .

b) Adoption of issue-based working groups

As to ensure efficiency of its work, the ATRT decided to create the following interdependent working groups:

1. Board performance
 - Governance, selection, composition (necessary skill set mix), accessibility, decision-making, dispute resolution/complaint handling and independent review of Board decisions.
2. GAC role
 - Interactions with Board and community, the existence of shared and clearly understood expectations with respect to the GAC's role in ICANN's decision-making processes, the quality and actionability of GAC input, and ICANN's responsiveness to that input.

3. Community/Stakeholder engagement

- Effectiveness and quality of ICANN support for the policy development process, the quality of PDP output and the extent to which the ICANN PDP develops consensus - including across stakeholder groups -, the level and quality of public input into the ICANN process, and the extent to which such input is reflected in ICANN decision-making.

4. IRB Independent Review of Board

Please refer to the ATRT's activities webpage <http://www.icann.org/en/reviews/affirmation/activities-1-en.htm> for further information on the composition of the teams.

The Review Team foresees the hiring of a third party group as to catalogue and cross-reference all material provided by ICANN. This librarian function may be shouldered by law students. Further investigations are to be conducted.

c) Review of ICANN staff produced material

The RT was provided with an update on its documental request (status – production). (DM) is to provide a list of any outstanding requests.

d) Adoption of a conference call and meeting calendar

The RT resolved to publish its conference call schedule on the designated web space and to open its calls to any member of the community who is interested to participate as a silent observer. Staff is to post technical details on the ATRT web space as soon as technical arrangements are made.

A deadline for decision on venues of third and fourth meetings was agreed to be one week after Brussels meeting. Both meetings are decided to take place on 30-31 Aug and 11-13 Oct respectively. To cut down travel expenses, it is proposed to hold both meetings in Mdr & Washington DC respectively to have the chance to also meet with ICANN staff and the contracted external consultant. The fifth and last F2F meeting is scheduled to take place on the margins of Cartagena ICANN meeting. The RT F2F meetings (dates and venues) are expected to be finalized, in accordance with the agreed deadline, during the RT next conference call.

e) Adoption of an evaluation scoring sheet

The RT drafted a scoring sheet based on the ICANN evaluation panel of external consultants and adopted the revised document as its framework for its selection process.

f) Discussion about Budget

The budget allocated to the Accountability & Transparency review was discussed in light of the expenses of the Review Team F2F meetings as well as the financial implications the management assessment review would induce. A final budget is still to be approved.

g) Presentation of the Proposals – RfP – by the pre-selected candidates

Five pre-selected consultants, out of a total of 7 respondents, were asked to submit their proposals to the Members of the ATRT, namely:

- Deloitte
- PRTM
- The Berkman Center
- Booz Allen Hamilton
- One World Trust

Recordings of these presentations are available at <http://icann.org/en/reviews/affirmation/activities-1-en.htm>.

As to respect confidentiality of the bidders' working methods and financial position, all proprietary information was communicated to the Review Team *in camera*. Transcripts will be redacted accordingly.

h) Scoring of the Proposals received

On basis of their evaluation panel, the ATRT scored the tenders presented to them – please refer to: <http://www.icann.org/en/reviews/affirmation/atrt-rfp-respondents-evaluation-19jun10-en.pdf>

i) Interaction with the community

As highlighted in its previous conference calls, the RT elaborated a schedule for ICANN's 38 meeting in Brussels with a view to meeting all of ICANN's constituencies.

Members resolved to open its meetings to public unless a request for a closed meeting was unequivocally submitted by those concerned.

In preparation for constructive exchanges with the community, the RT had pro-actively produced and provided lists of questions: to the community, Board, GAC, Joint Board/GAC WG.

In Brussels, all Members of the Review Team reiterated their wish to engage in an interactive dialogue with the community and highly encouraged participants to present any successful or unsuccessful case studies/examples during the sessions.

In addition to public discussions, the community was invited to send written responses to the RT list of questions through the public comment channel or any issues relevant to the work of the ATRT through a separate link that will be made public shortly.

The ATRT met with the following in open sessions:

- GNSO Council;
- Registrars;
- GAC/Board joint WG;
- Community;
- ALAC;
- NCSG ;

- Board;
- GAC;
- Registries;
- CSG;
- ccNSO.

Recordings and transcripts are posted on the ATRT's activities webpage:

<http://www.icann.org/en/reviews/affirmation/activities-1-en.htm> .

j) Meetings with ICANN Staff

The ATRT continued its exchange of opinions with the ICANN staff. This includes meeting with ICANN CEO, ICANN Senior staff as well as meeting with the Ombudsman.

k) Drafting of statements

The ATRT resolved to draft and publish two statements:

- Statement - ICANN Accountability and Transparency Review Team - Interaction with the Community - <http://www.icann.org/en/announcements/announcement-2-21jun10-en.htm>
- Brussels Statement - <http://www.icann.org/en/announcements/announcement-29jun10-en.htm>