| 1        | Ethan J. Brown (SBN 218814)   |  |  |  |
|----------|---|--|--|--|
| 2        | ethan@bnsklaw.com<br>Sara C. Colón (SBN 281514)   |  |  |  |
| 3        | sara@bnsklaw.com  |  |  |  |
| 4        | BROWN NERI SMITH & KHAN LLP  11766 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1670  Los Angeles, California 90025  Telephones (210) 502,0800 |  |  |  |
| 5        |   |  |  |  |
| 6        | Telephone: (310) 593-9890<br>Facsimile: (310) 593-9980  |  |  |  |
| 7        |   |  |  |  |
| 8        | Attorneys for Plaintiff DOTCONNECTAFRICA TRUST  |  |  |  |
| 9        | Borcon Derri Merr Trest   |  |  |  |
|          | SUPERIOR COURT OF THE   | E STATE OF CALIFORNIA                                      |  |  |
| 10       | COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES - CENTRAL   |  |  |  |
| 11       |   |  |  |  |
| 12       | DOTCONNECTAFRICA TRUST, a Mauritius Charitable Trust;   | Case No. BC607494  |  |  |
| 13<br>14 | Plaintiff,  | Assigned for all purposes to the Honorable Howard L. Halm  |  |  |
| 15       | V.  | EVIDENTIARY OBJECTIONS TO                                  |  |  |
| 16       | V.  | DECLARATION OF KEVIN ESPINOLA                              |  |  |
| 17       | INTERNET CORPORATION FOR ASSIGNED NAMES AND NUMBERS, a  | IN SUPPORT OF ICANN'S OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR |  |  |
| 18       | California corporation;   | PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION                                     |  |  |
| 19       | Defendants.   | DATE: December 22, 2016                                    |  |  |
| 20       |   | TIME: 8:30 a.m. DEPT: 53                                   |  |  |
| 21       |   |  |  |  |
| 22       |   |  |  |  |
| 23       |   |  |  |  |
| 24       |   |  |  |  |
| 25       |   |  |  |  |
| 26       |   |  |  |  |
| 27       |   |  |  |  |
| 28       |   |  |  |  |
| 20       |   |  |  |  |

EVIDENTIARY OBJECTIONS TO ESPINOLA DECLARATION

## Objections to Declaration of Kevin Espinola

| $2 \mid \mid$ | Espinola Declaration ¶                      | DCA Objection         | Sustained | Overruled |
|---------------|---|-----------------------|-----------|-----------|
| 3             | ¶2: ICANN and its community                 | 1. Lacks Foundation   |           |           |
| 1             | developed the New gTLD Applicant            | (Evid. Code § 403)    |           |           |
| 5             | Guidebook ("Guidebook") as part of a        | 2. Lacks Personal     |           |           |
| 5             | years-long, bottom-up                       | Knowledge (Evid.      |           |           |
| 7             | multistakeholder process during             | Code § 702)           |           |           |
| 3             | which numerous versions were                | 3. Best Evidence Rule |           |           |
| 9             | published by ICANN for public               | (Evid. Code § 1520)   |           |           |
| )             | comment and revised, in part based on       | (Evia. Code § 1320)   |           |           |
| 1             | comments received. In total, six            |                       |           |           |
| 2             | versions of the Guidebook were              |                       |           |           |
| 3             | published for public comment.               |                       |           |           |
| 1             | Espinola Declaration ¶                      | DCA Objection         | Sustained | Overruled |
| 5             | <b>¶3:</b> In the April 15, 2011 version of | 1. Lacks Foundation   |           |           |
| 5             | the Guidebook ("April 2011                  | (Evid. Code § 403)    |           |           |
| 7             | Guidebook"), language was added to          | 2. Lacks Personal     |           |           |
| 3             | Section 6 of Module 6 of the                | Knowledge (Evid.      |           |           |
| )             | Guidebook ("Covenant Not to Sue")           | Code § 702)           |           |           |
| )             | making explicit that: "[an] applicant       | 3. Improper Opinion   |           |           |
| 1             | may utilize any accountability              | Testimony (Evid.      |           |           |
| $2 \mid \mid$ | mechanism set forth in ICANN's              | Code §§800-803)       |           |           |
| 3             | Bylaws for [the] purposes of                | 4. Best Evidence Rule |           |           |
| 1             | challenging any final decision made         | (Evid. Code § 1520)   |           |           |
| 5             | by ICANN with respect to the                | (Lviu. Code § 1320)   |           |           |
| 11            | amplication " Attacked bounts on            |                       |           |           |
| 5             | application." Attached hereto as            |                       |           |           |
| 5<br>7        | Exhibit K is a true and correct copy of     |                       |           |           |

| 1  | the Guidebook, which was published   |                       |           |           |
|----|--------------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------|-----------|
| 2  | with a redline, showing changes made |                       |           |           |
| 3  | from the prior version of the        |                       |           |           |
| 4  | Guidebook.                           |                       |           |           |
| 5  | Espinola Declaration ¶               | DCA Objection         | Sustained | Overruled |
| 6  | ¶4: As ICANN has stated publicly,    | 1. Lacks Foundation   |           |           |
| 7  | ICANN is a not-for-profit public     | (Evid. Code § 403)    |           |           |
| 8  | benefit corporation and anticipated  | 2. Lacks Personal     |           |           |
| 9  | that, absent a broad waiver and      | Knowledge (Evid.      |           |           |
| 10 | limitation of liability in the       | Code § 702)           |           |           |
| 11 | Guidebook's terms and conditions,    | 3. Speculation (Evid. |           |           |
| 12 | the over 1,900 applicants could      | Code § 702)           |           |           |
| 13 | initiate frivolous and costly legal  | 4. Hearsay (Evid.     |           |           |
| 14 | actions in an attempt to challenge   | ·                     |           |           |
| 15 | legitimate ICANN decisions, which    | Code § 1200, et seq.) |           |           |
| 16 | would imperil the successful         | 5. Improper Opinion   |           |           |
| 17 | implementation of the New gTLD       | Testimony (Evid.      |           |           |
| 18 | Program. Accordingly, ICANN          | Code §702)            |           |           |
| 19 | carefully considered how to protect  |                       |           |           |
| 20 | the New gTLD Program from such       |                       |           |           |
| 21 | challenges, and the Covenant Not to  |                       |           |           |
| 22 | Sue in the Guidebook was deemed      |                       |           |           |
| 23 | appropriate in light of these        |                       |           |           |
| 24 | considerations.                      |                       |           |           |
| 25 |                                      |                       |           |           |
| 26 |                                      |                       |           |           |
| 27 |                                      |                       |           |           |

| 1        |                          |  |
|----------|--------------------------|--|
| 2        | Dated: December 15, 2016 | BROWN NERI SMITH & KHAN LLP                    |
| 3        |                          | Sa Q -   |
| 4        |                          | By:  |
| 5        |                          | Sara C. Colón                                  |
| 6        |                          | Attorneys for Plaintiff DOTCONNECTAFRICA TRUST |
| 7        |                          | DOTCONNECTAFRICA TRUST                         |
| 8        |                          |  |
| 9        |                          |  |
| 0        |                          |  |
| 1        |                          |  |
| 12       |                          |  |
| 13       |                          |  |
| 4        |                          |  |
| 15       |                          |  |
| 16       |                          |  |
| 17       |                          |  |
| 8        |                          |  |
| 9        |                          |  |
| 20       |                          |  |
| 21       |                          |  |
| 22       |                          |  |
| 23       |                          |  |
| 24<br>25 |                          |  |
| 25<br>26 |                          |  |
| 26<br>27 |                          |  |
| 28       |                          |  |
| .0       |                          |  |