

Report for ICANN Public Participation Committee: ICANN 43 Document Publication

0. Overview

This report relates to the Document Publication Operational Policy ¹ and the documents that were published or delayed with respect to the ICANN 43 publication deadline. It is organized into two sections:

1. Document Production and Timelines: This section provides an overview of the type of the documents produced, the publication time frames, and some examples of the documents published after the document deadline.

2. Observations, Conclusions and Future Improvements: Suggestions on how delays can be avoided are discussed.

1. Document Production and timelines

According to the Document Publication Operational Policy, the document publication deadline is 15 working days for ICANN Public Meetings related documentation. For ICANN 43 the deadline was 20 February 2012.

Below each document published before and during ICANN 43 is considered in relation to this requirement.

1.1 Meeting Schedule and Session details:

Meeting schedule:

ICANN 43 Meeting Schedule was published on 1 March 2012, 10 days after the deadline.

Primarily, the schedule publication was delayed due to a new internal method for assigning the competitive slots for Monday. While new, collaborative methods are important to develop, this should have been managed with more discipline in order to meet the deadline.

This was explained during the Public Forum at ICANN 43 publicly in response to a question² (pages 19-20 from the Public Forum Transcript file linked at <http://costarica43.icann.org/node/29713>).

The table below shows the timeline for operational activities relating to meeting schedules and session details:

Session requests forms due from staff	03 February 2012
Board sessions submitted	15 February 2012
20 additional sessions submitted	03 February - 07 March 2012
15-day schedule posting deadline	20 February 2012
Schedule changes recommended by board and exec team submitted	24 February 2012
Actual schedule posting date due to delays outlined above	01 March 2012
100+ changes made by staff to time/date/room or other session details	20 February - 14 March 2012
25+ new agendas added to existing sessions	08 -13 March 2012
21 new presentations added	23 February - 10 March 2012
15 new presentations added	11 March 2012
16 new presentations added	12 March 2012
12 new presentations added	13 March 2012
12 new presentations added	14 March 2012
17 new presentations added	15 - 16 March 2012

Presentations:

ICANN seeks to follow a deadline of 48 hours for presentations to be published on the meeting session pages. This allows presenters to use the most up-to-date data in their presentations and helps remote participants to follow the sessions. It is often a challenge to collect materials from all of the relevant presenters (which may include both staff and external presenters) in time to meet this deadline. Presentations also often reflect content from a recent meeting.

Public Forum agenda:

In regard to the Public Forum agenda, this is developed with input from ICANN community leaders (SO/AC/SG Chairs). Their input depends on their consultations within their groups and this takes time. ICANN staff continues to work with the community to balance the desire for early publication with the need to collect community input and the need for flexibility to address topics that emerge leading up to or during the meeting.

Publishing the agenda about a week prior to the Public Forum helps increase community awareness and allows participants to prepare their remarks. This improves the quality and quantity of the participation during the forum. Community members expressed appreciation for this new approach in Costa Rica.

1.2 Documents

A review of announcements and data collected from Staff indicate that over 80 documents or Document sets (Announcements, Reports, Fact sheets, Public

Comments (containing multiple documents so counted as 1 Document set)) were published during the period of 01 November - 16 March 2012). The full set of documents is attached.

Among these 41 were tagged to be related to ICANN 43 and required to facilitate sessions during the meeting.

Of these 41, four (4) were documents for GNSO Council Open Meeting for which an 8-day advance publication deadline applies. These were considered timely due to the specific policy. GNSO members have not complained of this timing. These are the documents that are highlighted in blue in the attached full set of documents.

Overall, out of the 41 documents, 7 were delayed (17%) and 34 were on time (83%) according to the set policies. (If we are to consider the GNSO Council documents as late, then of 41 documents, 11 were delayed or 73% were on time.)

In two of the delayed documents (or document sets) the reason for delay was related to the involvement and/or response/approval of a third party or an ICANN community group.

1.1 Some examples of documents published after 20 February 2012:

1) Inter-Registrar Transfer Policy Part B Policy Development Process – Recommendation 8 Concerning Standardizing and Clarifying WHOIS Status Messages (Type: Public Comment, Opened for Comments on 21 February, Not for public review/discussion in Costa Rica so not tagged as delayed)

2) Final Report FoI WG Obtaining and documenting Consent of ccTLD manager for request of delegation and redelegation (Type: Report, Published on 27 February, Tagged as Delayed, Reason for Delay: Signed off by the ccNSO FoI WG on 25 February).

3) Progress Report Negotiations on the Registrar Accreditation Agreement (Type: Report, Published on 1 March 2012, Tagged as Delayed, Reason for delay: bilateral agreement on negotiation status caused a delay in production of the final report. ³⁾

1.2 Post-meeting Materials and Archives

Materials used for all sessions are linked and archived through the following links and session details:

<http://costarica43.icann.org/full-schedule>

<http://costarica43.icann.org/documents-archive>

The following materials can be reached for sessions through these links as archives:

- Presentations
- Transcripts (if applicable)
- Audio and video recordings

Note that for those sessions that receive live scribing during sessions, the transcripts are provided within 7 days. For those sessions that did not receive live scribing, the transcripts are provided within 30 days post-meeting.

There were no delays reported for these postings following ICANN 43.

2. Observations, Conclusions and Future Improvements

- There were delays observed at ICANN 43 for meeting schedule, agenda and some document publication as outlined above. ICANN Staff should work towards better planning and community collaboration, which will help to reduce majority of these delays.
- This report was also delayed in terms of its submission to the PPC due to missing data for ICANN 43 and for previous meetings.
- Staff is committed to timely publication, and tracking of publications that will also result in effective reporting for the future.
- As a further improvement, it is also recommended that the PPC revise the wording of the Document Publication Operational Policy and present an improved version to the ICANN Board for approval due to the following problems:
 - Which documents should be subject to the policy should be better defined. Current wording creates confusion among readers, leads to false expectations among the community, and adds complexity for clear data collection for reporting. In many cases, it is difficult to draw a clear line between a document that is required for the meeting (e.g., a commitment has already been made, or there is a specific session to discuss it), versus a document that may be relevant to the meeting (e.g., new information is available, and as such would be useful to discussions, but no meeting session is dependent on the document being published).
 - The policy also does not seem to consider the more specific documentation policies and deadlines of various policy-making bodies of ICANN, such as GNSO and ccNSO Councils and working groups. These should be mentioned in the policy explicitly as exceptions to the general

policy (Examples of these for ICANN 43 are the documents that are highlighted in blue in the attached full set of documents).

Prepared by:
Filiz Yilmaz, Sr Dir Participation and Engagement

Reviewed and edited by:
David Olive, VP Policy Development, Kurt Pritz, Sr VP Stakeholder Relations

¹ [Document Publication Operational Policy](http://www.icann.org/en/groups/board/participation/document-publication-operational-policy-30oct09-en.pdf) at
<http://www.icann.org/en/groups/board/participation/document-publication-operational-policy-30oct09-en.pdf>

² Pages 19-20 from the Public Forum Transcript file linked at
<http://costarica43.icann.org/node/29713>

³ Pages 19-20 from the Public Forum Transcript file linked at
<http://costarica43.icann.org/node/29713>

ICANN Document Inventory - Starting from November 2011							
Subject to the Policy (1=Yes)	LATE (1=YES)	#	TITLE	URL	CONTENT TYPE	PUBLICATION DATE	Other
1		1	.ASIA One and Two Character Allocation Proposal	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-04nov11-en.htm	Public Comment	04-Nov-11	
1		2	ATRT Recommendation 5: Board Compensation Independent Valuation Expert's Report Available for Viewing	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-3-04nov11-en.htm	Announcement	04-Nov-11	
1		3	Revisions to Annex A of the Bylaws to Adopt the New GNSO Policy Development Process	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-04nov11-en.htm	Public Comment	04-Nov-11	
		4	Talk to Our Web Designers: How Can We Improve ICANN.ORG?	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-10nov11-en.htm	Announcement	10-Nov-11	
1		5	Board Technical Relations Working Group (BTRWG) – Final Report for Public Comment	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-16nov11-en.htm	Public Comment	16-Nov-11	
		6	New gTLD Customer Service Center Expands to Offer More Services	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-4-21nov11-en.htm	Announcement	21-Nov-11	
1		7	Preliminary Issue Report on 'Thick' Whois	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-21nov11-en.htm	Public Comment	21-Nov-11	
		8	New gTLD Program: ICANN Seeks Independent Objector	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-3-21nov11-en.htm	Announcement	21-Nov-11	
1		9	Inter-Registrar Transfer Policy Part C Policy Development Process	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-21nov11-en.htm	Public Comment	21-Nov-11	
1		10	Inter-Registrar Transfer Policy Part B – Recommendation #8 and #9 Part 2 – Staff Proposals	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-22nov11-en.htm	Public Comment	22-Nov-11	
1		11	Implementation Notice - Version 3.0 of IDN Guidelines	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-3-22nov11-en.htm	Announcement	22-Nov-11	
		12	Nominating Committee Convenes in Dakar	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-22nov11-en.htm	Announcement	22-Nov-11	
		13	Deadline for EBERO RFI Extended	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-23nov11-en.htm	Announcement	23-Nov-11	
		14	EBERO RFI Q&A Published	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-29nov11-en.htm	Announcement	29-Nov-11	
		15	RAA Negotiations Community WIKI	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-02dec11-en.htm	Announcement	02-Dec-11	
1		16	WHOIS Policy Review Team Draft Report	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-05dec11-en.htm	Public Comment	05-Dec-11	
1		17	CEO Search Committee Progress	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-12dec11-en.htm	Announcement	12-Dec-11	
1		18	Preliminary GNSO Issue Report on the Registrar Accreditation Agreement Amendments	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-12dec11-en.htm	Public Comment	12-Dec-11	
1		19	Notice of Publication: Revised IDN ccTLD Fast Track Process Implementation Plan	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-15dec11-en.htm	Announcement	15-Dec-11	
1		20	Public Comment: New gTLD Applicant Support Program: Financial Assistance	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-20dec11-en.htm	Announcement	20-Dec-11	
1		21	Further Progress by the CEO Search Committee	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-20dec11-en.htm	Announcement	20-Dec-11	
1		22	2011 Annual Report Published	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-21dec11-en.htm	Announcement	21-Dec-11	
1		23	New Year Brings More Public Comment Enhancements to Life, Addressing Four ATRT Recommendations	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-22dec11-en.htm	Announcement	22-Dec-11	
		24	Fellowship Program Brings Global Voices Together at ICANN Fellows Announced for San Jose, Costa Rica Meeting	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-4-23dec11-en.htm	Announcement	23-Dec-11	
1		25	IDN Variant Issues Project: Draft Integrated Issues Report	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-23dec11-en.htm	Public Comment	23-Dec-11	
		26	Apply Now for ICANN's Leadership Positions Apply Now to Join the ICANN Board, the Councils of GNSO and ccNSO, and the ALAC	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-23dec11-en.htm	Announcement	23-Dec-11	
1		27	Continued Operations Instrument Guidelines Available for New gTLD Applicants	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-3-23dec11-en.htm	Announcement	23-Dec-11	
		28	CEO Announces ICANN Stands Ready for New gTLD Launch	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-3-06jan12-en.htm	Announcement	06-Jan-12	
1		29	Initial Report on Universal Acceptance of IDN TLDs	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-06jan12-en.htm	Public Comment	06-Jan-12	
		30	Fellowship Application Round Opens for ICANN International Public Meeting 44 in Prague, Czech Republic Program Ensures Global Representation at ICANN's Public Meetings	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-06jan12-en.htm	Announcement	06-Jan-12	
		31	Join ICANN for a Discussion on the Next Big thing New Top-Level Domains and the Expanding Global Internet	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-09jan12-en.htm	Announcement	09-Jan-12	
		32	ICANN Community to Meet and Greet in Washington, D.C., January 10	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-09jan12-en.htm	Announcement	09-Jan-12	

1		33	New gTLDs Update: Applications Accepted Today; New Guidebook Posted; Financial Assistance for Qualifying Applicants	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-11jan12-en.htm	Announcement	11-Jan-12	
1		34	Framework for the FY 13 Budget	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-17jan12-en.htm	Public Comment	17-Jan-12	
1		35	CEO Search Committee Announces Deadline for Submitting Applications	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-19jan12-en.htm	Announcement	19-Jan-12	
1		36	CAT WHOIS Proposed Changes	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-20jan12-en.htm	Public Comment	20-Jan-12	
1		37	Inter-Registrar Transfer Policy Part B Policy Development Process - Recommendation 9, Part 2 Concerning a New Provision to Lock and Unlock Domain Names	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-23jan12-en.htm	Public Comment	23-Jan-12	
			SAC 052: SSAC Advisory on Single-Character Internationalized Domain Name Top-Level Domains				31-Jan-12 SSAC generally doesn't publish documents for specific meetings. However, both documents SSAC published thus far this year came out in advance of Costa Rica meeting.
1			Thick' Whois Final Issue Report	http://gnso.icann.org/issues/whois/final-report-thick-whois-02feb12-en.pdf	Report	02-Feb-12	
		38	Pre-Costa Rica ICANN Policy Update Webinar Invitation	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-03feb12-en.htm	Announcement	03-Feb-12	
		39	ICANN Seeks Evaluators for the Support Applicant Review Panel (SARP) - Request for Expressions of Interest (EOI)	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-3-03feb12-en.htm	Announcement	03-Feb-12	
1		40	Interim Report on Support Significantly Interested Parties for ccTLD Delegation or Redelegation Requests	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-03feb12-en.htm	Public Comment	03-Feb-12	
1		41	Defensive Applications for New gTLDs	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-06feb12-en.htm	Public Comment	06-Feb-12	
		42	ICANN Reaffirms Commitment to Second Round in New gTLD Program, Seeks Public Comment on Trademark Protections, and Moves Forward on Applicant Support Program	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-09feb12-en.htm	Announcement	09-Feb-12	
		43	Tell Us What You Think of the Nominating Committee	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-10feb12-en.htm	Announcement	10-Feb-12	
1		44	Further Bylaw Changes Following Adoption of Revised Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO) Policy Development Process (PDP)	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-10feb12-en.htm	Public Comment	10-Feb-12	
1		45	Public Comment: Roadmap to a New Domain Name Registration Data Access Protocol (WHOIS)	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-18feb12-en.htm	Announcement	18-Feb-12	
1		46	IDN Variant Issues Project: Final Integrated Issues Report Published and Proposed Project Plan for Next Steps is Now Open for Public Comment	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-20feb12-en.htm	Announcement	20-Feb-12	
		47	CEO Search Update	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-21feb12-en.htm	Announcement	21-Feb-12	
		48	Inter-Registrar Transfer Policy Part B Policy Development Process – Recommendation 8 Concerning Standardizing and Clarifying WHOIS Status Messages	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-21feb12-en.htm	Public Comment	21-Feb-12	Not for public review / discussion in Costa Rica
1			Recommendations Report on IRTP B Rec 8 to the Board	http://gnso.icann.org/drafts/recommendations-report-irtp-b-8-22feb12-en.pdf	Report	22-Feb-12	Document for GNSO Council Open Meeting for which 8 day in advance publication deadline applies
		49	Draft Advice Letter on Consumer Trust, Consumer Choice, and Competition	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-23feb12-en.htm	Public Comment	23-Feb-12	Not for public review / discussion in Costa Rica
		50	Joint Letter to ICDR on Further Scheduling	http://www.icann.org/en/news/irp/manwin-v-icann/joint-letter-icdr-13feb12-en	File	26-Feb-12	
1	1		Final Report Fol WG Obtaining and documenting Consent of ccTLD manager for request of delegation and redelgation	http://ccnso.icann.org/announcements/announcement-27feb11-en.htm		27-Feb-12	Signed of by the ccNSO Fol WG 25 February
		51	Report of Public Comments Draft Final Report of the Internationalized Registration Data Working Group	http://www.icann.org/en/news/public-comment/report-comments-ird-draft-final-report-28feb12-en	File	28-Feb-12	Not for public review / discussion in Costa Rica
		52	REMINDER NOTICE: 29 March is Last Day to Register as New gTLD Applicant	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-29feb12-en.htm	Announcement	29-Feb-12	
		53	ICANN and Registrar Negotiation Team Post Summary of RAA Negotiations	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-01mar12-en.htm	Announcement	01-Mar-12	
1	1	54	Progress Report Negotiations on the Registrar Accreditation Agreement	http://www.icann.org/en/resources/registrars/raa/raa-negotiations-progress-report-01mar12-en	File	01-Mar-12	
		55	Law Enforcement Recommendations Regarding Amendments to the Registrar Accreditation Agreement	http://www.icann.org/en/resources/registrars/raa/raa-law-enforcement-recommendations-01mar12-en	File	01-Mar-12	

		56	SAC 053 SSAC Report on Dotless Domains	http://www.icann.org/en/groups/ssac/documents/sac-053-en	File	23-Feb-12	SSAC generally doesn't publish documents for specific meetings. However, both documents SSAC published thus far this year came out in advance of Costa Rica meeting.
		57	Public Comment: Proposal to Protect International Red Cross and International Olympic Committee Names at the Top Level in New gTLDs	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-02mar12-en.htm	Announcement	02-Mar-12	Not for public review / discussion in Costa Rica
		58	Call for Videos: New gTLD Applicant Stories and Learnings Sought	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-02mar12-en.htm	Announcement	02-Mar-12	
1	1	59	Report of Public Comments Work Continues to Increase Developing Economies Participation in the New gTLD Program	http://www.icann.org/en/news/public-comment/report-comments-jas-final-report-02mar12-en	File	02-Mar-12	
		60	Draft DNS Risk Management Framework WG Charter	http://www.icann.org/en/other/dns-risk-mgmt/draft-charter-28feb12-en	File	02-Mar-12	
		61	Further Bylaw Changes Following Adoption of Revised Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO) Policy Development Process (PDP) Report of Comments	http://www.icann.org/en/news/public-comment/report-comments-bylaws-amend-gnsopdp-05mar12-en	File	05-Mar-12	Not for public review / discussion in Costa Rica
1			Locking of a Domain Name Subject to UDRP Proceedings Charter	http://gns0.icann.org/drafts/locking-domain-name-udrp-proceedings-charter	Charter	05-Mar-12	Document for GNSO Council Open Meeting for which 8 day in advance publication deadline applies
1		87	Fake Renewal Notices Report	http://newgns0.icann.org/issues/frn/fake-renewal-notices-report-06mar12-en.pdf	Announcement	06-Mar-12	Document for GNSO Council Open Meeting for which 8 day in advance publication deadline applies
		62	Beginner's Guide to Participating in At-Large	http://www.icann.org/en/about/learning/beginners-guides/participating-at-large-beginners-guide-06mar12-en	File	06-Mar-12	
1			Final GNSO Issue Report on the RAA Amendments	http://gns0.icann.org/issues/raa/final-issue-report-raa-06mar12-en.pdf	Report	06-Mar-12	Document for GNSO Council Open Meeting for which 8 day in advance publication deadline applies
		63	Contractual Compliance Update	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-08mar12-en.htm	Announcement	08-Mar-12	
		64	Thought Paper on Domain Seizures	http://www.icann.org/en/about/staff/security/guidance-domain-seizures-07mar12-en	File	08-Mar-12	
		65	SSAC Public Report: Work Plan for 2012, March 2012	http://www.icann.org/en/groups/ssac/workplan-activities/ssac-activity-report-09mar12-en	File	09-Mar-12	Not for public review / discussion in Costa Rica
1	1	66	FY13 SO-AC-SG Additional Budget Requests	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-09mar12-en.htm	Announcement	09-Mar-12	
		67	Costa Rica President Laura Chinchilla to Address ICANN Public Meeting	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-10mar12-en.htm	Announcement	10-Mar-12	
		68	ICANN Board Conflicts of Interest Review - Revised Conflicts of Interest Policy and Related Governance Documents	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-2-11mar12-en.htm	Announcement	11-Mar-12	
1	1	69	Governance Materials Memo	http://www.icann.org/en/groups/board/governance/materials-memo-11mar12-en	File	11-Mar-12	
1	1	70	Proposed Corporate Governance Guidelines	http://www.icann.org/en/groups/board/governance/guidelines-corporate-11mar12-en	File	11-Mar-12	
		71	Revised Expected Standards of Behavior (in Redline)	http://www.icann.org/en/about/transparency/expected-standards-redline-11mar12-en	File	11-Mar-12	
		72	Revised Code of Conduct (in Redline)	http://www.icann.org/en/groups/board/governance/bod-code-of-conduct-redline-11mar12-en	File	11-Mar-12	
		73	Revised Board Conflicts of Interest Policy (in Redline)	http://www.icann.org/en/groups/board/governance/coi-coi-policy-redline-11mar12-en	File	11-Mar-12	
		74	ICANN Seeks Expressions of Interest for Review of Accountability Mechanisms	http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements/announcement-11mar12-en.htm	Announcement	11-Mar-12	
1	1	75	Potential Subjects for Consideration by the Expert Group	http://www.icann.org/en/about/aoc-review/atrr/mechanisms-subjects-11mar12-en	File	11-Mar-12	

